CIRCULAR LETTER NO. 1662

January 14, 1994

To All Members and Subscribers of the Bureau:

GENERAL REVISION OF RATES
EFFECTIVE JANUARY 1, 1994
APPLICABLE TO NEW AND RENEWAL BUSINESS

The Commissioner of Insurance has approved a general revision of workers' compensation rates, effective 12:01 A.M., January 1, 1994, applicable to new and renewal policies. The approval includes:

1. RATE LEVEL DECREASE OF 10.2%

An overall average decrease of 10.2% in the existing workers' compensation average rates.

2. EXPERIENCE RATING PLAN CHANGES

The Experience Rating Plan Expected Loss Rates have been revised. The other Experience Rating Plan values remain the same. The State Per Claim Accident Limitation and the State Multiple Claim Accident Limitation remain unchanged.

3. ELIMINATION OF THE MASSACHUSETTS ASSIGNED RISK RATING PLAN ("MARRP")

This Plan, which was approved effective January 1, 1993, has been eliminated and will not apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

4. ELIMINATION OF THE REVISION OF ALL RISK ADJUSTMENT PROGRAM ("ENHANCED ARAP")

The Enhanced ARAP, which was approved effective January 1, 1993, has been eliminated and will not apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994. The ARAP formula used in 1994 will be that used in 1992.
5. CHANGE IN THE CREDITS AVAILABLE UNDER THE QUALIFIED LOSS MANAGEMENT PROGRAM ("QLMP")

The QLMP, as most recently amended and approved effective January 1, 1993, will provide for an additional 25% of the approved credit in the fourth year of a policyholder's participation in the QLMP. The additional credit applies to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

6. NO CHANGE IN THE TAKE-OUT CREDIT PROGRAM

For policy year 1994, there shall be no change in the Take-Out Credit Program, as last revised to be effective on and after January 1, 1993 and as last clarified in CIRCULAR LETTER NO. 1654 dated September 23, 1993.

7. NO CHANGES IN RETROSPECTIVE RATING PLAN

While the Bureau has made a number of filings related to Retrospective Rating, none of these pending filings is reflected in this approval. Any resulting changes will be made if and when any of those filings are approved.

8. NO CHANGES IN THE FOLLOWING:

A. Loss Constants
B. Expense Constants
C. Table of Specific Disease Elements
D. Manual rates for the Admiralty Law and Federal Employers' Liability Act classifications
E. "F" classifications
F. U. S. Longshore and Harbor Workers' Compensation Act Coverage "Non-"F" Percentage.

Experience ratings, and ARAP factors, issued to be effective during January and February 1994 will be reissued using the new Expected Loss Rates.

The new rates will be made available shortly. When the new rates, experience ratings, and ARAP factors are received, carriers should no longer attach Massachusetts Pending Premium Change Endorsement WC 20 04 01 to policies effective on and after January 1, 1994 and should recalculate estimated premiums on policies already issued.

NORMAN R. FONTAINE
Vice President of Industry Affairs

NRF/pw/47
Attachments
DECISION, FINDINGS & ORDER CONCERNING THE FILING OF THE WORKERS' COMPENSATION RATING AND INSPECTION BUREAU FOR PROPOSED WORKERS' COMPENSATION AND INSURANCE RATES TO BE EFFECTIVE ON AND AFTER JANUARY 1, 1994

Issued: January 13, 1994

Docket Number G93-45
APPEARANCES:

Scott P. Lewis, Esq.
Palmer & Dodge
One Beacon Street
Boston, MA. 02108
    for: The Workers' Compensation Rating and
        Inspection Bureau
        Petitioner

Craig T. Spratt, Esq.
Stephen J. D'Amato, Director
State Rating Bureau
470 Atlantic Avenue
Boston, MA.
    for: The State Rating Bureau
        Division of Insurance
        Intervenor

Matthew Chafe, Executive Director
Workers' Compensation Advisory Council
600 Washington Street
Boston, MA.
On December 6, 1993 the Workers' Compensation Rating and Inspection Bureau of Massachusetts ("WCRB") filed with the Division of Insurance ("Division") a request for a decrease of approximately 2.9 percent in workers' compensation insurance premiums, to be effective January 1, 1994 ("WCRB filing" or "filing") (Exhibit 2). The WCRB is a rating organization licensed pursuant to General Laws Chapter 152, §52C, representing approximately one hundred private insurance companies which provide workers' compensation insurance in Massachusetts. The last general rate increase for workers' compensation insurance was effective January 1, 1993. On December 7, 1993, pursuant to the decision rendered December 29, 1992 on 1993 workers' compensation insurance rates, classifications and rating values, the State Rating Bureau of the Division of Insurance ("SRB") proposed modification of the All Risk Adjustment Program, the Qualified Loss Management Program ("QLMP"), and the Large Risk Rating Option.

Pursuant to General Laws Chapter 152, §53A, the Commissioner of Insurance ("Commissioner") is required to conduct a hearing to determine whether the classifications and rates proposed are "not excessive, inadequate, unfairly discriminatory to the risks to which they respectively apply and that they fall within a range of reasonableness." By notice issued December 7, 1993, hearing on this rate request, and on the proposal of the SRB, was set for December 30, 1993.

A public hearing was held at the offices of the Division on December 30, 1993 to afford interested persons an opportunity to be heard on the WCRB's rate request and present testimony on workers' compensation insurance rates. Commissioner Ruthardt, and Hearing Officers Susan Anderson and Jean Farrington presided. The State Rating Bureau ("SRB") intervened in this proceeding, and the Workers' Compensation Advisory Council, through its Executive Director, appeared.

During the portion of the hearing reserved for public comment, several reasons supporting the concept of a rate decrease were voiced. Participants credited the Workers' Compensation Reform Law of 1991 for successfully controlling workers' compensation insurance costs, as well as the efforts of the Department of Industrial Accidents ("DIA"), the agency that adjudicates claims. Commissioner Campbell of the DIA provided compelling information on the decrease in the number of new claims filed, and the speed with which they are being processed. Matthew Chafe of the Workers' Compensation Advisory Council ("WCAC"), which is charged with oversight of the DIA and workers' compensation in general, expressed the WCAC's hope that stability had returned to the market and supported the concept of a rate decrease. Attorney Lewis, representing the WCRB, noted that this was the first time in two decades that the WCRB had proposed an overall rate decrease. Stephen D'Amato,
Director of the State Rating Bureau, expressed his opinion that the rate reduction proposed was less than that which was actuarially indicated. He credited the 1991 Reform as well as the response of employees and insurers to its provisions, as well as the DLA, with effecting its success.

After the public comment, two prehearing conferences were held to establish a schedule for hearing the contested portions of the rate request.

On January 13, 1994, the State Rating Bureau and the WCRB advised us that they had reached an agreement on the issues presented in the case. On that date the parties submitted the Stipulation with Respect to Rates, Classifications and Rating Plans ("Stipulation"). (Exhibit 3). The Stipulation is attached to, and incorporated into this decision. At a hearing held on January 13, the parties reviewed the terms of the Stipulation with the presiding officers.

In the Stipulation, inter alia, the parties agree not to object to or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of the WCRB's filing, subject to the condition that the overall average decrease in the existing workers' compensation average rates, effective on and after January 1, 1994, shall be 10.2 percent, and subject to the other conditions set forth in the Stipulation. The Stipulation provides that in calculating the average rates, the WCRB shall "cap" the rate level change for each rating classification so that it is no greater than plus or minus 15 percent of the average rate level change for construction classes, or plus or minus 20 percent of the average rate level change for manufacturing and all other classes, but otherwise in the manner shown in Section X-G of the WCRB filing. The Stipulation provides that these revised manual rates shall apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

The Stipulation also addressed the Massachusetts All Risk Rating Program (the "MARRP"), the retrospective rating plan for risks subject to assignment under G.L. c. 152, §65A that was approved effective January 1, 1993. The MARRP was the subject of a proceeding held pursuant to G.L. c. 152, §65C(2)(g), and docketed in the Division as G93-46. Hearing on the proposal of the SRB to eliminate the MARRP was held December 30, 1993, concurrently with this hearing. The parties have agreed that neither the WCRB nor the SRB would oppose or appeal from approval by the Commissioner in this proceeding of the elimination of the MARRP. Incorporation of the elimination of the MARRP, effective January 1, 1994, into this Order renders moot the order issued December 31, 1993, under Docket 93-46, eliminating the MARRP. Therefore, in accordance with the Stipulation filed here, an order is concurrently issued in Docket 93-46 vacating as moot the order issued December 31, 1993.

Finally, the Stipulation also addressed the revision of the All Risk Adjustment Program that was approved effective January 1, 1993 ("Enhanced ARAP"), and the Qualified Loss Management Program ("QLMP"). With respect to the All Risk Adjustment Program, the parties agreed that neither would object to or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of elimination of the revision of the All Risk
Adjustment Program that was approved effective January 1, 1993 ("Enhanced ARAP"). The effect of this order will be to restore the terms and conditions of ARAP as they existed immediately before the last revision, effective January 1, 1993. This order applies to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

The parties also agreed that neither would object to or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of a change in the credits available under the QLMP as most recently amended and approved effective January 1, 1993, to provide for an additional 25% of the approved credit in the fourth year of a policyholder's participation in the QLMP, to apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

Finally, the parties agree that for policy year 1994, neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall propose any revisions of the Take Out Credit program, as last revised to be effective on and after January 1, 1993 and as last clarified in WCRB Circular Letter 1654 dated September 23, 1993.

ORDER

In conclusion, based on the record in this proceeding, we find that the stipulated rates, classifications and rating plans fall within a range of reasonableness, and are not excessive, inadequate, or unfairly discriminatory for the risks to which they respectively apply. Specifically, after reviewing the parties' Stipulation and the record of this proceeding, we find that the filing provides adequate support for the stipulated rate decrease to be effective January 1, 1994 and that, subject to the conditions of the Stipulation, the WCRB's filing complies with the requirements of G.L. c. 152, §53A. We therefore approve the Stipulation in its entirety, and the WCRB's filing, effective on and after January 1, 1994, subject to the terms and conditions of the Stipulation.

We find that the Massachusetts Assigned Risk Rating Plan, the retrospective rating plan for risks subject to assignment under G.L. c. 152, §65A that was approved effective January 1, 1993, should be eliminated. Accordingly, we hereby order that the Massachusetts Assigned Risk Rating Plan be eliminated. This order applies to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

Further, we hereby approve the elimination of the revision of the All Risk Adjustment Program that was approved effective January 1, 1993 ("Enhanced ARAP"). The effect of this order will be to restore the terms and conditions of the All Risk Adjustment Program as they existed immediately before the last revision, effective January 1, 1993. This order applies to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

Finally, we hereby approve a change in the credits available under the Qualified Loss Management Program ("QLMP") as most recently amended and approved.
effective January 1, 1993, to provide for an additional 25% of the approved credit in the fourth year of a policyholder's participation in the QLMP. This order applies to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

January 13, 1994

Linda Ruthardt  
Commissioner of Insurance

Susan G. Anderson  
Chief Hearing Officer  
Presiding Officer

Jean F. Farrington  
Presiding Officer
COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

DIVISION OF INSURANCE

Docket No. 93-45

In re:
APPLICATION OF THE WORKERS' COMPENSATION RATING AND INSPECTION BUREAU OF MASSACHUSETTS FOR APPROVAL OF A GENERAL RATE REVISION TO BE EFFECTIVE ON AND AFTER JANUARY 1, 1994.

STIPULATION WITH RESPECT TO RATES, CLASSIFICATIONS AND RATING PLANS FOR 1994

In order to avoid further hearings, delay, and uncertainty for insureds and insurers, and to permit orderly implementation of new workers' compensation insurance rates effective on and after January 1, 1994, but without in any way admitting or agreeing to any substantive position taken by the other party, the Workers' Compensation Rating and Inspection Bureau of Massachusetts ("WCRB") and the State Rating Bureau ("SRB") stipulate as follows:

1. Neither the WCRB nor the SRB will object to or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of Insurance ("Commissioner") of the WCRB's general rate filing dated December 6, 1993 (the "WCRB Filing"), subject to the condition that the overall average decrease in the existing workers' compensation average rates, to be effective on and after January 1, 1994, shall be -10.2%, and subject to the other conditions set forth in this Stipulation. In calculating the average rates, the WCRB shall "cap" the rate level change for each rating classification so that it is no greater
than plus or minus 15% of the average rate level change for construction classes, or plus or minus 20% of the average rate level change for manufacturing and all other classes, but otherwise in the manner shown in Section X-G of the WCRB Filing. In calculating the final manual rates, the WCRB shall also use the offset for Merit Rating and ARAP (1.065), the offset for the increase in the Executive Officer's Payroll Cap, and (for eligible classes) the offset for the Construction Classification Premium Adjustment, all in the manner and with the values shown in Section X-R of the WCRB Filing. A revision of Section X-R, Exhibit 1, reflecting this Stipulation, is attached as Exhibit A. These revised manual rates shall apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994. The Expected Loss Rates to be used in the Experience Rating Plan for new and renewed policies effective on and after January 1, 1994 shall, for each rating classification, be the arithmetic average of the Expected Loss Rate proposed in the WCRB Filing and the Expected Loss Rate in the existing rates that were approved effective January 1, 1993. There shall be no other changes in the existing rates, classifications, rating programs, rating plans, rating factors or rating values (collectively, "rates, classifications and rating plans") except as specifically set forth in this Stipulation.

2. Neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall oppose or appeal from an order by the Commissioner vacating as moot her December 31, 1993 Decision under G.L. c. 152, § 65C(2)(g) on the Massachusetts Assigned Risk Rating Plan, the retrospective rating plan for risks subject to assignment under G.L. c. 152, § 65A that was approved effective January 1, 1993, in Docket No. 93-46 (the "December 31 MARRP Decision"). Absent this Stipulation, the WCRB states that it would have appealed the December 31 MARRP Decision. Both the WCRB and the SRB agree,
and in approving this Stipulation the Commissioner acknowledges, that after it has been vacated as moot, the December 31 MARRP Decision shall have no force or effect, and shall not establish a precedent of any kind for the exercise of whatever power the Commissioner may have under § 65C(2)(g). In addition, the order by the Commissioner vacating as moot the December 31 MARRP Decision shall not establish a precedent of any kind.

3. Neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall oppose or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of the elimination of the Massachusetts Assigned Risk Rating Plan (the "MARRP"), the retrospective rating plan for risks subject to assignment under G.L. c. 152, § 65A that was approved effective January 1, 1993, to apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.

4. Neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall oppose or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of the elimination of the revision of the All Risk Adjustment Program ("Enhanced ARAP") that was approved effective January 1, 1993, to apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994. The effect of the elimination of the Enhanced ARAP will be to restore the terms and conditions of ARAP as they existed immediately before the last revision, effective January 1, 1993, was made.

5. Neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall oppose or appeal from approval by the Commissioner of a change in the credits available under the Qualified Loss Management Program ("QLMP"), as most recently amended and approved effective January 1, 1993, to provide for an additional 25% of the approved credit in the fourth year of a policyholder's participation in the QLMP, to apply to new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1994.
6. For policy year 1994, neither the WCRB nor the SRB shall propose, and the Commissioner shall not make, any revisions of the Take Out Credit Program, as last revised to be effective on and after January 1, 1993 and as last clarified in WCRB Circular Letter 1654 dated September 23, 1993.

7. The WCRB (or any successor organization) will not submit a filing for a general revision of workers' compensation rates, classifications or rating plans before November 15, 1994, or submit such a filing with an effective date earlier than January 1, 1995, or submit any other filing of workers' compensation rates, classifications or rating plans proposed to take effect prior to the next general revision of workers' compensation rates, classifications and rating plans, unless (a) the laws with respect to workers' compensation insurance rates, benefits, or any other matter dealt with in this Stipulation are amended, in which case an earlier filing may be made, provided it shall be based upon and limited to the effect of such amendments, or (b) the SRB agrees in writing, based on actual Massachusetts experience or otherwise, that a filing of workers' compensation rates, classifications or rating plans submitted before November 15, 1994, or submitted with an effective date earlier than January 1, 1995, should be considered by the Commissioner. Notwithstanding the above, the WCRB may submit the following filings before November 15, 1994 and with an effective date earlier than January 1, 1995: filings proposing changes in the Merit Rating Plan; in Retrospective Rating Plans; in the Construction Credit Program; in the QLMP (other than changes in credit structure or amounts); in classifications or classification definitions; in the Statistical Plan; in A-Rates; in F-Class rates; in policy endorsements; in rules or forms; or in servicing carrier reimbursements for certain categories of expenses. This ¶ 7 does not provide any basis for the disapproval of
any filings already pending before the Commissioner. If the WCRB makes a filing that violates the terms of this ¶ 7, the Commissioner should disapprove such a filing.

8. The SRB agrees to consider whatever evidence of actual Massachusetts experience the WCRB may submit to the SRB during 1994, and agrees to review promptly the WCRB's next filing for a general revision of workers' compensation rates, classifications or rating plans, and to confer with the WCRB to consider reaching an agreement on a general revision of rates, classifications or rating plans to apply to new and renewal policies to be effective on and after January 1, 1995. The WCRB and SRB agree that the notice of the public hearing on such filing shall be issued so that the first day of the hearing at which members of the public may comment upon such filing shall occur as early as practicable, consistent with giving any required public notice. The WCRB and the SRB further agree that even if they cannot agree before January 1, 1995 or at any time with respect to the general revision of rates, classifications or rating plans resulting from a WCRB filing made prior to January 1, 1995, that any revision of rates, classifications or rating plans resulting from such a filing (whether before or after an appeal), including a revision of rates, classifications, or rating plans resulting in rate or premium increases or decreases, and including a revision of rates, classifications or rating plans in a prompt refiling made to meet all conditions of any disapproval of a WCRB filing made prior to January 1, 1995 (whether before or after an appeal), shall be effective as of January 1, 1995 and shall apply to all new and renewal policies effective on or after January 1, 1995. If she approves this Stipulation, the Commissioner shall agree to make any order on a general revision of rates, classifications or rating plans resulting from a WCRB filing made prior to January 1, 1995, effective as to all new and
renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1995. The WCRB and the SRB agree that with respect to the issue of the effective date of a general revision of rates, classifications or rating plans, any such order will have no precedential value and will not be relevant in future hearings on any line of insurance and that they will not attempt to introduce it as evidence or to rely on it with respect to that issue in future hearings. The WCRB and SRB agree not to appeal from any such order on the grounds that any such general revision of rates, classifications or rating plans resulting from a WCRB filing made prior to January 1, 1995, is effective as to all new and renewal policies effective on and after January 1, 1995, but otherwise reserve whatever rights they may have to appeal any such order on revised rates, classifications or rating plans.

9. The WCRB and the SRB agree that, except as set forth in ¶¶ 7 and 8 above, this Stipulation will have no precedential value and will not be relevant in future hearings on any line of insurance and that they will not attempt to introduce it (or the decision adopting it) as evidence or to rely on it (or the decision adopting it) for any purpose in future hearings, provided that the Stipulation may be considered in any future hearing with respect to the implementation of this Stipulation, but only on the issue of the implementation of this Stipulation. The WCRB and the SRB each acknowledges that this Stipulation does not imply approval or disapproval by either party of any particular ratemaking methodology or projection. Except as set forth in ¶ 7 above, each party reserves the right to contest in future hearings all aspects of this Stipulation.

10. Each party enters into this Stipulation upon the condition that it is approved by the Commissioner, in its entirety, on the record of this hearing no later
than January 14, 1994. If the Commissioner does not vacate as moot the December 31 MARRP Decision as provided in ¶ 2 above and does not approve this Stipulation in its entirety, including the changes in rating plans described in ¶¶ 3, 4 and 5 above, by January 14, 1994, this Stipulation shall be null and void and shall not be relied upon by any party, or by the Commissioner, for any purpose whatsoever.

11. If any person not a party to this Stipulation successfully challenges the Commissioner's approval of this Stipulation and the Commissioner's approval is suspended, set aside or otherwise rendered ineffective, the WCRB may immediately make a filing of revised rates, classifications or rating plans, and if it does, this Stipulation shall be null and void and shall not be relied upon by any party, or by the Commissioner, for any purpose.

WORKERS’ COMPENSATION RATING AND INSPECTION BUREAU OF MASSACHUSETTS
By its attorneys,

STATE RATING BUREAU
By its attorneys,

Scott P. Lewis
PALMER & DODGE
One Beacon Street
Boston, MA 02108
(617) 573-0100

Stephen J. D’Amato
STATE RATING BUREAU
Division of Insurance
470 Atlantic Avenue
Boston, MA 02210
(617) 521-7334

Dated: January 12, 1994
EXHIBIT A

Section X - Classification Pricing
Subsection R - Adjustments to Derive Final Manual Rates
1/1/94

Revised
Section X-R
Exhibit 1

MASSACHUSETTS WORKERS’ COMPENSATION
CLASSIFICATION PRICING

CALCULATION OF PROPOSED MANUAL RATES

The proposed manual rates in Section X-S are derived from the proposed average capped rates in Section X-Q as follows:

Proposed Manual Rate =

[Proposed Average Rate/(Factor 1 x Factor 2 x Factor 3)]

Where for each classification:

| Factor 1 | = 1.065 = the offset for Merit Rating and ARAP. |
| Factor 2 | = The offset for the increase in the Executive Officer’s Payroll Cap (See Exhibit 3 of Section X-R of the filing for 1/1/94 rates). |
| Factor 3 | = For eligible classes the offset for the Construction Classification Premium Adjustment Program (See Exhibit 4 of Section X-R of the filing for 1/1/94 rates, for classifications not eligible for this program, Factor 3 = 1.000). |

In Re: THE MASSACHUSETTS ASSIGNED RISK RATING PLAN APPLICABLE TO POLICIES ISSUED THROUGH THE WORKERS' COMPENSATION ASSIGNED RISK POOL

Docket No. G93-46

Memorandum Order

On December 31, 1993 the Commissioner of Insurance issued a decision and order in the above-captioned matter which 1) eliminated the Massachusetts Assigned Risk Rating Plan ("MARRP") from workers' compensation policies issued to or renewed for insureds in the assigned risk pool on or after January 1, 1994; and 2) permitted the Workers' Compensation Rating and Inspection Bureau of Massachusetts ("WCRB") to amend its rate filing, to be considered in Docket G93-45, to reflect any rate impact resulting from elimination of the MARRP. By stipulation dated January 12, 1994 and filed January 13, 1994 the WCRB and the State Rating Bureau ("SRB"), the parties to this proceeding and to the rate hearing, agreed to workers' compensation rates for policies issued or renewed on or after January 1, 1994 and further agreed not to appeal or oppose the Commissioner's approval of elimination of the MARRP incorporated in her decision and order in Docket No. G93-45. We have approved that stipulation. As a result of the stipulation and order in G93-45, the order issued on December 31, 1993 in G93-46 has become moot and the order is hereby vacated as moot.

Done and ordered this 13th day of January, 1994.

Linda Retherford
Commissioner of Insurance

Susan G. Anderson
Chief Hearing Officer
Presiding Officer

Jean F. Farrington
Presiding Officer